Calibration of $\delta^{18}$O of cultured benthic foraminiferal calcite as a function of temperature

C. Barras$^{1,2}$, J.-C. Duplessy$^2$, E. Geslin$^1$, E. Michel$^2$, and F. J. Jorissen$^1$

$^1$Laboratory of Recent and Fossil Bio-Indicators (BIAF) UPRES EA 2644, CNRS-INSU UMS 3281 OSUNA, Angers University, France, and Laboratory of Marine Bio-Indicators (LEBIM), Ile d’Yeu, France

$^2$Laboratoire des Sciences du Climat et de l’Environnement (LSCE), CEA-CNRS-UVSQ, Gif-sur-Yvette, France

Received: 16 December 2009 – Published in Biogeosciences Discuss.: 18 January 2010
Revised: 13 April 2010 – Accepted: 20 April 2010 – Published: 29 April 2010

Abstract. The geochemical composition of deep-sea benthic foraminiferal calcite is widely used to reconstruct sea floor paleoenvironments. The calibration of the applied proxy methods has until now been based on field observations in complex natural ecosystems where multiple factors are interfering. However, laboratory experiments with stable physico-chemical conditions appear to be the ideal way to evaluate the influence of a single parameter. In this paper, we present the oxygen isotopic composition of deep-sea benthic foraminiferal shells entirely calcified under controlled experimental conditions over a large temperature range (4 to 19 °C). The new laboratory protocols developed for this study allowed us to produce large quantities of shells in stable conditions, so that also the shell size effect could be investigated. It appears that when considering a narrow test size range, the curve describing the temperature dependency of $\delta^{18}$O in Bulimina marginata is parallel to the thermodynamically determined curve observed in inorganically precipitated calcite ($-0.22‰ \degree C^{-1}$). This observation validates the use of $\delta^{18}$O of this benthic species in paleoceanographic studies. Over the studied size range (50 to 300 µm), the effect of test size was 0.0014‰ µm$^{-1}$, confirming previous suggestions of a substantial test size effect on $\delta^{18}$O of benthic foraminifera. This study opens new perspectives for future proxy calibrations in laboratory set-ups with deep-sea benthic foraminifera (e.g. quantification of the influence of the carbonate chemistry).

1 Introduction

Stable oxygen isotopes of carbonate microfossils are one of the most widely used tools in paleoceanography. The temperature dependency of oxygen isotope fractionation has previously been quantified on the basis of inorganically precipitated calcite (Urey, 1947; McCrea, 1950; O’Neil et al., 1969; Kim and O’Neil, 1997), and has been verified for living organisms in field and/or laboratory cultures of corals (Reynaud-Vaganay et al., 1999), molluscs (Epstein et al., 1953) and planktonic foraminifera (Erez and Luz, 1983; Bouvier-Soumagnac and Duplessy, 1985; Bouvier-Soumagnac et al., 1986; Bemis et al., 1998). For benthic foraminifera, until now, all existing temperature calibrations are based on core top material. On the sea floor, not only temperature and the isotopic composition of the seawater influence the $\delta^{18}$O/$\delta^{16}$O composition of foraminiferal calcite, but also other factors, such as the carbonate ion effect (Spero et al., 1997; Zeebe, 1999; Rathmann and Kunhert, 2008), vital effects (Duplessy et al., 1970) and diagenetic processes may strongly influence the $\delta^{18}$O of carbonate microfossils. Since many of these factors co-vary in the natural environment, only culture experiments can precisely reveal the influence of a single parameter, such as temperature.

Several laboratory studies have been performed to study the oxygen isotopic fractionation in planktonic and shallow water benthic foraminifera (e.g. Erez and Luz, 1983; Bouvier-Soumagnac and Duplessy, 1986; Chandler et al., 1996; Spero and Lea, 1996; Spero et al., 1997; Bemis et al., 1998). However, experiments with deep-sea benthic foraminifera are very scarce (Wilson-Finelli et al., 1998; McCorkle et al., 2008; Filipsson et al., 2010). Actually, the growth of deep-sea benthic foraminifera takes much longer.
than for planktonic foraminifera so that the experiments in stable conditions have to last for periods extending to several months. However, benthic foraminifera present the indisputable advantage that they can reproduce in the laboratory (Hintz et al., 2004; McCorkle et al., 2008; Barras et al., 2009; Filipsson et al., 2010). It is therefore possible to measure the isotopic composition of shells entirely calcified under controlled conditions.

In order to obtain the results presented in this paper, we developed new laboratory protocols to produce large quantities of Bulimina marginata shells under controlled and stable conditions and over a large range of temperatures (4–19°C), making it possible to investigate the influence of temperature on the δ18O of deep-sea benthic foraminiferal calcite. The large amount of foraminiferal shells produced allowed us also to investigate the effect of test size on isotopic fractionation.

2 Material and methods

2.1 Experimental protocols

For this study, adult specimens of B. marginata (non-symbiont-bearing benthic species) sampled in the Bay of Biscay at 450 and 650 m depth, were used in different experiments to obtain reproduction and subsequent growth of the juveniles (detailed protocol and data on reproduction and growth rates of B. marginata in Barras et al., 2009). Before their introduction in the experiments, adult specimens were labelled using a calcein-tagging method (Bernhard et al., 2009) in order to distinguish specimens that totally calcified their shells in our controlled experiments (not fluorescent specimens).

Two different laboratory setups were used to obtain reproduction and growth of B. marginata under stable physico-chemical conditions: (1) a closed system (CS1 and CS2), with 251 microfiltrated (0.45 µm) natural seawater circulating through a reservoir and different experiment bottles, and (2) a Petri dish system (PD) where half of the seawater was renewed twice per week. Between 30 and 190 adult specimens of B. marginata were introduced in each experiment, which were regularly fed with fresh Phaeodactylum tricornutum diatoms. In all experiments, which lasted from 43 to 108 days, we obtained production and growth of juveniles of Bulimina marginata. Therefore, the isotopic composition of foraminiferal calcite was measured on tests of Bulimina marginata entirely calcified under controlled laboratory conditions (not fluorescent specimens).

Temperature was recorded inside the incubators (standard deviations range from 0.1 to 1.1°C depending on the incubator). Culture water samples were collected every 3 to 7 days to verify the stability of salinity (35.8 ± 0.1), δ18Oseawater (0.6 ± 0.1‰ vs. SMOW), pH and alkalinity, and the absence of significant evaporation (details in Table 1).

The carbonate chemistry was stable, and similar in experiments CS1 and PD (7.94 ± 0.05 for pH, NBS-scale, and 2453 ± 34 µmol l−1 for alkalinity; Table 1). However, an episodic peak of high alkalinity and pH was recorded during the first week of the PD experiments, which is probably irrelevant for the geochemical composition of the newly formed shells, since B. marginata only reproduces after several weeks of incubation (Barras et al., 2009). For CSII, a gradual decrease of pH by 0.3 units between the start and the end (average of 7.79 ± 0.09, NBS-scale) occurred in the six experiments, whereas alkalinity remained stable, and similar to the other systems (2523 ± 14 µmol l−1) (Table 1). In the hypothetical case of linear growth of the shells during the experimental period, this gradual decrease of pH by 0.3 units could theoretically result in a positive δ18O shift of about 0.15‰ of the newly formed foraminifera, due to the carbonate ion effect (Zeebe, 1999). However, benthic foraminifera do not have a uniform growth, chamber addition being faster during early ontogenetic stages (Bradshaw, 1957; Stouff et al., 1999; Barras et al., 2009).

2.2 Analytical procedures

Oxygen isotopic analyses were performed on 10 to 150 entire specimens of B. marginata. In order to study the ontogenetic effect on the 18O/16O ratios of the shells of deep-sea benthic foraminifera, specimens were separated into different size fractions (length measurements with microscope). Observation of the shells under the stereomicroscope showed that they were transparent with no mineral adhesives visible. Therefore specimens were only rinsed with deionised water before analysis. All tests were then roasted at 380°C during 45 min to remove all organic matter. The 18O/16O ratio of foraminiferal calcite was measured with Iso-prime and VG-Optima mass-spectrometers. Results are expressed as δ18O = (Rsample−Rstandard)/Rstandard · 1000, where R is the 18O/16O isotopic ratio. The analytical precision of the δ18O analyses is ±0.05‰ relative to the VPDB (Vienna Pee Dee Belemnite) standard.

Seawater δ18O (δ18Ow) was measured by equilibrating water samples with pure CO2 which was subsequently analysed with a Finnigan Mass spectrometer. The analytical precision of the δ18O analyses is ±0.05‰ relative to the VSMOW (Vienna Standard Mean Ocean Water) standard.

In order to determine the relationship between temperature and δ18O of B. marginata shells, we calculated least square regressions of the isotopic difference between foraminiferal shell and seawater (δ18O (T) − δ18Ow) versus temperature. The δ18Ow data were converted from VSMOW to VPDB by subtracting 0.27‰ (Hut, 1987). We applied linear regression to our data sets since this provided equally good fits as quadratic regression. The choice of linear or quadratic equations was discussed by Bemis et al. (1998). If we consider for example the paleotemperature equations of Kim and O’Neil (1969) and apply linear regression for the temperature range
Table 1. Physico-chemical parameters (temperature, salinity, pH and alkalinity) measured during PD, CSI and CSII experiments, total number of *B. marginata* shells entirely calcified under controlled conditions per experimental temperature, and δ^{18}O composition of the shells according to different size fractions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Temperature (°C)</th>
<th>Salinity (µmol/l)</th>
<th>pH</th>
<th>Alkalinity (% PDB)</th>
<th>Total number of <em>B. marginata</em> shells produced (all sizes)</th>
<th>Size fraction (&lt; 150)</th>
<th>δ^{18}O (‰ PDB)</th>
<th>δ^{18}O_δ^{18}O_w (‰ PDB)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Petri dish system PD</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.9 ± 0.1</td>
<td>35.9 ± 0.1</td>
<td>7.92 ± 0.06</td>
<td>2449 ± 36</td>
<td>402</td>
<td>&lt; 150</td>
<td>2.02</td>
<td>1.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2 ± 0.1</td>
<td>35.8 ± 0.1</td>
<td>7.92 ± 0.06</td>
<td>2451 ± 43</td>
<td>593</td>
<td>&lt; 150</td>
<td>1.47</td>
<td>1.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.7 ± 0.2</td>
<td>35.9 ± 0.1</td>
<td>7.93 ± 0.06</td>
<td>2450 ± 52</td>
<td>585</td>
<td>&lt; 150</td>
<td>0.97</td>
<td>0.64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.7 ± 0.1</td>
<td>35.9 ± 0.1</td>
<td>7.94 ± 0.07</td>
<td>2454 ± 46</td>
<td>445</td>
<td>&lt; 150</td>
<td>0.46</td>
<td>0.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.0 ± 0.1</td>
<td>35.9 ± 0.1</td>
<td>7.91 ± 0.05</td>
<td>2412 ± 15</td>
<td>890</td>
<td>&lt; 150</td>
<td>0.89</td>
<td>0.56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Closed system CSI</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.9 ± 0.1</td>
<td>35.8 ± 0.1</td>
<td>7.94 ± 0.04</td>
<td>2454 ± 24</td>
<td>304</td>
<td>&lt; 150</td>
<td>2.08</td>
<td>1.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1 ± 0.1</td>
<td>35.8 ± 0.1</td>
<td>7.96 ± 0.04</td>
<td>2457 ± 21</td>
<td>777</td>
<td>&lt; 150</td>
<td>1.31</td>
<td>0.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.7 ± 0.1</td>
<td>35.9 ± 0.1</td>
<td>7.98 ± 0.04</td>
<td>2473 ± 34</td>
<td>719</td>
<td>&lt; 150</td>
<td>0.79</td>
<td>0.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.7 ± 0.1</td>
<td>35.8 ± 0.1</td>
<td>7.96 ± 0.04</td>
<td>2473 ± 31</td>
<td>569</td>
<td>&lt; 150</td>
<td>0.49</td>
<td>0.16</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
of our experiments (4–19 °C), we obtain a maximum temperature offset of 0.2 °C compared to the quadratic equation. This variation corresponds to a δ18Oj bias of 0.05‰ which is equivalent to the precision of the mass-spectrometer. The coefficient of determination (R2) and the standard errors on the slope and intercept are indicated for each equation.

3 Results and discussion

3.1 Influence of temperature on the δ18O of cultured foraminifera

Knowing that shell size may have an effect on isotope ratio in foraminifera (Spero and Lea, 1996; Bemis et al., 1998; Elderfield et al., 2002; Schmiedl et al., 2004), our data were treated according to four different size fractions to consider this possible effect on B. marginata: ≤150 µm, 150–200 µm, 200–250 µm and >250 µm. For each of the four size fractions, we plotted the oxygen isotopic composition of the shell of B. marginata (δ18Oj−δ18Ow) as a function of the different temperatures tested in the experiments (Fig. 1a–d, Table 1).

The 18O/16O composition of B. marginata appears similar for the 3 experimental protocols (CS1, CSII and PD) for a given temperature and given size fraction (Fig. 1). For the ≤150 and 150–200 µm size fractions, where sufficient data are available, we used Lin’s test (Lin, 1989) to estimate the concordance of the regression lines for the three systems. For all cases, we obtained concordance correlation coefficients above 0.990, confirming the high degree of similarity of the data obtained with the three systems. Therefore, we conclude that the pH decrease in CSII did not cause a significant shift of the δ18O of foraminifera calcified in these experiments. Since the δ18O of B. marginata appears to be independent of the applied protocol, in the following text we will no longer distinguish the three experimental set-ups.

The linear equations which best describe the relationship between temperature and δ18O of foraminiferal tests entirely calcified under controlled laboratory conditions are, for the four different size fractions (Fig. 1):

\[ T(°C) = 15.25 (±0.17) - 4.54 (±0.14) \cdot (δ^{18}O_j - δ^{18}O_w) \]  

for ≤150µm

Biogeosciences, 7, 1349–1356, 2010

www.biogeosciences.net/7/1349/2010/

Table 1. Continued.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Temperature (°C)</th>
<th>Salinity (µmol/l)</th>
<th>pH</th>
<th>Alkalinity (µmol/l)</th>
<th>Total number of B. marginata shells produced (all sizes)</th>
<th>Size fraction (‰ PDB)</th>
<th>δ18Oj (‰ PDB)</th>
<th>δ18Oj−δ18Ow</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Closed system CSII</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 ± 1.1</td>
<td>35.8 ± 0.1</td>
<td>7.80 ± 0.07</td>
<td>2528 ± 13</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>&lt; 100</td>
<td>2.77</td>
<td>2.44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.0 ± 0.5</td>
<td>35.8 ± 0.1</td>
<td>7.80 ± 0.08</td>
<td>2524 ± 12</td>
<td>261</td>
<td>&lt; 100</td>
<td>2.31</td>
<td>1.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3 ± 0.7</td>
<td>35.8 ± 0.1</td>
<td>7.78 ± 0.09</td>
<td>2524 ± 13</td>
<td>2461</td>
<td>&lt; 100</td>
<td>1.85</td>
<td>1.52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.6 ± 0.3</td>
<td>35.8 ± 0.1</td>
<td>7.80 ± 0.10</td>
<td>2525 ± 11</td>
<td>567</td>
<td>100–150</td>
<td>1.21</td>
<td>0.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.2 ± 0.2</td>
<td>35.8 ± 0.1</td>
<td>7.77 ± 0.10</td>
<td>2521 ± 19</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>150–200</td>
<td>−0.07</td>
<td>−0.40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19.3 ± 0.1</td>
<td>35.8 ± 0.1</td>
<td>7.80 ± 0.09</td>
<td>2519 ± 16</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>150–200</td>
<td>−0.44</td>
<td>−0.77</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Equations (1, 2 and 3) exhibit similar slopes considering the standard errors on the slope estimates. For these three size fractions, the relative influence of temperature on the oxygen isotopic composition of *B. marginata* is $-0.22\%{\text{C}}^{-1}$. For the > 250 µm size fraction, the linear regression between $\delta^{18}O_f - \delta^{18}O_w$ and temperature presents a steeper slope (Eq. 4). However, the linear regression for this size fraction is less well defined than that obtained for the smaller size fractions, since data are available only for three different temperatures and only few individuals attained a size larger than 250 µm. Further experimental work is needed to refine this (Eq. 4), which we will not consider in the remaining part of this paper.

### 3.2 Influence of shell size on the $\delta^{18}O$ of cultured foraminifera

Interestingly, there is an increase in the intercept values with increasing size fraction (15.25, 15.73 and 16.00 respectively for the size fractions ≤150, 150–200 and 200–250 µm; Fig. 1e), indicating a shift towards higher $\delta^{18}O$ values with increasing size. In Fig. 2, individual $\delta^{18}O$ measurements are...
with size. However, some authors observed an ontogenetic δ18O effect (Bemis et al., 1998; Elderfield et al., 2002), whereas well-established for planktonic foraminifera (Spero and Lea, 1996; Bemis et al., 1998; Elderfield et al., 2002), whereas generally, in these studies, benthic foraminifera do not show a significant change in δ18O with size. However, some authors observed an ontogenetic effect on the oxygen isotopic fractionation of Bulimina aculeata/marginata shells obtained in laboratory experiments (McCorckle et al., 2008; Filipsson et al., 2010) and living and dead Uvigerina mediterranea from the western Mediterranean Sea (Schmiedl et al., 2004). Schmiedl et al. (2004) found a 0.3\textendash}0.4‰ δ18O enrichment over a size range of 175 to 1250 µm. This enrichment was particularly important in the early growth stages (100\textendash}300 µm) and became weaker for adult forms, which might be explained by the decreasing metabolic rates towards more adult life stages. If we compare the slope of their logarithmic correlation equation for these younger stages (the size fraction we studied) with our data, their δ18O versus test size curve has an average slope of about 0.001‰ µm\(^{-1}\) which is similar to the size effect found in our experiments. Even if adult specimens of B. marginata are smaller than adult specimens of U. mediterranea, it is probable that the specimens measured in our experiments were not large enough to reach the stable isotopic composition typical of larger specimens, as observed for U. mediterranea (Schmiedl et al., 2004). Either our specimens were still growing when the experiments were stopped, or they died before attaining the “adult” stage. It would be useful in future experiments to grow living B. marginata during longer time than in our experiments and try to obtain larger size fractions.

On the basis of all our 83 δ18O measurements performed on specimens of B. marginata which totally calcified under controlled conditions (Table 1), we applied a multiple regression that takes into account δ18O of the shells, calcification temperature (4\textendash}19 °C) as well as test size (50\textendash}300 µm). According to this multiple regression, the averaged size effect on δ18O composition of B. marginata is 0.0014‰ µm\(^{-1}\). It appears therefore that an ontogenetic effect on oxygen isotope fractionation exists also for benthic foraminifera and cannot be neglected in paleoceanographic studies. Since the regression lines of δ18O\textsubscript{f} versus test size are more or less parallel for the tested temperatures, we conclude that the mechanism responsible for this small ontogenetic effect is independent of calcification temperature. We recommend performing measurements in a size range not larger than 50 µm to fully exploit the 0.07‰ accuracy of mass-spectrometric analyses.

3.3 Comparison with equilibrium calcite as defined by Kim and O’Neil (1997)

Among the numerous paleotemperature equations published since the 1950’s, Kim and O’Neil (1997) reinvestigated the relationship of O’Neil (1969) based on inorganically precipitated calcite for a temperature range between 10 and 40 °C (Eq. 5).

\[ T(°C) = 16.1 - 4.64 \cdot (δ^{18}O_f - δ^{18}O_w) + 0.09 \cdot (δ^{18}O_f - δ^{18}O_w)^2 \]  

We compared our experimental calibration equations with the Kim and O’Neil (1997) equation because this equation was established under controlled laboratory conditions as in...
These studies were supported by CEA, 2010

Over the investigated temperature range of 4 to 19 °C and 200–250 µm size classes, the biological effect is negligible (account the standard errors), suggesting that for the 150–200 µm fraction is closer to Kim and O’Neil relationship is represented by the red line.

Fig. 3. Comparison of our experimental calibration equation with the theoretical equation for equilibrium calcite of Kim and O’Neil (1997). The brown, blue and green lines represent the calibration equations of cultured Bulimina marginata from ≤150, 150–200 and 200–250 µm size fractions, respectively. The quadratic equation derived from Kim and O’Neil (1997) relationship is represented by the red line.

our study, and measurements were performed on inorganic calcite, free of vital effects. The three experimental regression curves we determined for size fractions smaller than 250 µm exhibit similar slopes as the least square regression line applied to the quadratic relationship of Kim and O’Neil (1997) over the studied temperature range (Fig. 3). Therefore, the influence of temperature on the δ18O of calcite is similar, and independent of test size. Furthermore, the offsets of the foraminiferal curves with respect to the inorganic carbonate curve are very small. Regression lines (2) and (3) fit well with the Kim and O’Neil (1997) equation (taking into account the standard errors), suggesting that for the 150–200 and 200–250 µm size classes, the biological effect is negligible. Over the investigated temperature range of 4 to 19 °C, the difference on the temperature estimates between Eqs. 2, 3 and the Kim and O’Neil equation is at most 0.7 °C. However, the calibration equation of cultured Bulimina marginata for the 200–250 µm fraction is closer to Kim and O’Neil relationship than the equations derived for smaller size fractions. Additional measurements are necessary to accurately study the δ18O of size fractions larger than 250 µm.

4 Conclusions

The new protocols developed for this study allowed us to obtain reproduction and calcification of the deep-sea benthic foraminifer Bulimina marginata under controlled conditions at 12 different temperatures between 4 and 19 °C. In general, a 1 °C decrease in calcification temperature increases the δ18O of Bulimina marginata by +0.22‰, irrespective of the size fraction and culture setup considered. This effect is similar to the thermodynamical effect observed for inorganic calcite. However, our data show a small but conspicuous ontogenetic effect on δ18O values of about 0.0014%·µm−1 that should be taken into account in order to produce accurate paleoclimatic reconstructions. Bulimina marginata specimens with a test length between 150 and 250 µm calcify very close to the equilibrium calcite as defined by Kim and O’Neil (1997). Finally, these experiments, leading to reliable data, proved that the foraminiferal treatment protocols developed for this study could be applied in future studies to investigate the impact of other physico-chemical parameters (salinity, carbonate chemistry...) on benthic foraminiferal shell composition (isotopes, trace metals...).

Acknowledgements. These studies were supported by CEA, CNRS, UVSQ and the Region Pays de la Loire. We are grateful to M. Gaultier for her precious technical support in the laboratory and to G. Hunault for his help with statistics. We thank B. Minster, F. Vimeux and A. Mackensen for seawater δ18O measurements and careful discussions on calibration of laboratory standards, and F. Dewilde and F. Manssouri for making foraminiferal δ18O measurements with their usual accuracy. We would like to thank L. de Nooijer and G. Schmiedl for their constructive reviews and useful comments. This is LSCE contribution number 4208.

Edited by: J. Bijma

The publication of this article is financed by CNRS-INSU.

References


Bouvier-Soumagnac, Y., Duplessy, J.-C. and Bé, A. W. H.: Isotopic composition of a laboratory cultured planktonic foraminifer


